

**F. No. 2/14/2015-PPP
Government of India
Ministry of Finance
Department of Economic Affairs
(PPP Cell)**


New Delhi the, April, 23, 2015

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: Record of Discussions of the 72nd Meeting of the Public-Private-Partnership-Appraisal-Committee (PPPAC), held on April 10, 2015

Please find enclosed the Record of Discussions of the 72nd Meeting of the Public-Private-Partnership-Appraisal-Committee (PPPAC) chaired by Secretary, Economic Affairs & Finance Secretary held on **April 10, 2015**.

Encl: as stated


(Abhilasha Mahapatra)
Director (PPP)
23.4.15

To,

1. Secretary, Department of Expenditure, North Block, New Delhi.
2. CEO, NITI Aayog, Yojana Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Secretary, Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Transport Bhavan, New Delhi.
4. Secretary, Department of Legal Affairs, Shastri Bhavan, New Delhi.
5. Secretary, Ministry of Environment & Forest, Indira Paryavaran Bhavan, New Delhi

Copy to:

Shri R.K. Singh, Joint Secretary (Highways), Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Transport Bhawan, New Delhi.

Copy also to:

1. PSO to Finance Secretary
2. Sr. PPS to AS (Inv)
3. Sr. PS to JS (Infra.)
4. PS to Director (PPP)

F. No. 2/14/2015-PPP
Government of India
Ministry of Finance
Department of Economic Affairs

Public Private Partnership Appraisal Committee

72nd Meeting held on April 10, 2015

Record Note of Discussions

The 72nd meeting of the Public-Private-Partnership-Appraisal-Committee (PPPAC), chaired by Secretary, Economic Affairs & Finance Secretary, was held on April 10, 2015. The list of participants is **annexed**.

2. It was noted that the PPPAC would consider four proposals in the road sector from Ministry of Road Transport & Highways (MoRTH) for final approval.

Agenda Item I: Proposal from Ministry of Road Transport & Highways for grant of final approval: Four laning of Amravati to Chikhli Section of NH-6 from Km 166.000 to Km 360.000 in the state of Maharashtra under NHDP Phase IV on Design, Build, Finance, Operate, Transfer (DBFOT) Toll basis (Package-I)

Total length: 194 km; Total Project Cost: Rs. 2288.18 crore; Cost of pre-construction activities to be financed by NHAI: Rs. 466 crore; Concession Period: 19 years including 2.5 years of construction period.

Land status: Total land required: 1214 ha; RoW available: 647 ha (53.29%); land to be acquired- 567 (46.71%); Forest land - 2.63 ha, Govt. Land: 42.367 ha; Notified under 3A: 666 ha ; Notified under 3D: 488 ha (97.42%); Notified under 3G: 388 ha (89.43%); land in possession: 904 ha (74.46%); Compensation completed to the land owner – 215 ha.

Status of Clearences: Environment Clearance: obtained on 01.04.2013; Forest Clearences Stage-1: Obtained; GAD: approved by Railways; Wild life Cleareance: Not required

Major development works/ structures: Major Bridge: 14; Flyovers/ Interchange: 1; ROBs; 4; Bypass: 3 of 24.57 km at Borgaon (4.7 km), Khamgaon (13.87 km) & Nandura (6 km) ; Major road junctions: 15; Service/ slip roads: 70.54 km ; Toll plazas: 3 at km 218.75, km 280.642 & km 356.542; Minor bridges : 85+11 on service roads; Minor road junctions: 100; Vehicular underpass: 13+9; Pedestrian/Cattle underpasses: 11; Culverts: 184; Truck laybys: 5; Rest Area: 1; Bus bays and shelters: 52; Re-constructions: 8.905 km at 6 locations; Metal Crash Barrier: 2*2.22 km.



Agenda Item II: Proposal from Ministry of Road Transport & Highways for grant of final approval: Four laning of Chikhli to Fagne Section of NH-6 from Km 360.000 to Km 510.000 in the state of Maharashtra under NHDP Phase IV on Design, Build, Finance, Operate, Transfer (DBFOT) Toll basis(Package-II)

Total length: 150 km; Total Project Cost: Rs. 1852.50 crore; Cost of pre-construction activities to be financed by NHAI: Rs. 600.32 crore; Concession Period: 15 years including 2.5 years of construction period.

Land status: Total land required: 899.33 ha; RoW available: 417.65 ha (46.44%); land to be acquired- 481.68 (53.56%); Forest land – 6.50 ha, Govt. Land: 29.33 ha; Notified under 3A: 616.27 ha ; Notified under 3D: 426.94 ha (94%); Notified under 3G: 322.83 ha (85.80%); land in possession: 710 ha (79%); Compensation completed to the land owner – 263 ha.

Status of Clearances: Environment Clearance: obtained on 01.04.2013; Forest Clearances Stage-1: Obtained; GAD: approved by Railways; Wild life Clearance: Not required

Major development works/ structures: Major Bridge: 7; Flyovers/ Interchange: Nil; ROBs; 5; Bypass: 4 of 29.100 km; Major road junctions: 15; Service/ slip roads: 89.612 km ; Toll plazas: 2 at km 415.980 & km 488.66; Minor bridges : 54+6 on service roads; Vehicular underpass: 16; Pedestrian/Cattle underpasses: 12+4; Culverts: 272; Truck laybys: 4; Rest Area: Nil; Bus bays and shelters: 42.

Agenda Item III: Proposal from Ministry of Road Transport & Highways for grant of final approval: Four laning of Fagne- Guj-Maharashtra Border Section of NH-6 from Km 510.000 to Km 650.794 in the state of Maharashtra under NHDP Phase IV on Design, Build, Finance, Operate, Transfer (DBFOT) Toll basis(Package-III)

13

Total length: 140.794 km; Total Project Cost: Rs. 1885.74 crore; Cost of pre-construction activities to be financed by NHAI: Rs. 436 crore; Concession Period: 19 years including 2.5 years of construction period.

Land status: Total land required: 846 ha; RoW available: 376 ha (44.44%); land to be acquired- 470 (55.56%); Forest land – 39.49 ha, Govt. Land: 31.49 ha; Notified under 3A: 700 ha ; Notified under 3D: 427 ha (94.91%); Notified under 3G: 315 ha (81.67%); land in possession: 680 ha (80.37%); Compensation completed to the land owner – 265 ha.

Status of Clearances: Environment Clearance: obtained on 01.04.2013; Forest Clearances Stage-1: Obtained; GAD: approved by Railways for 2 RoBs out of 3; Wild life Clearance: Not required

Major development works/ structures: Major Bridge: 10; Flyovers/ Interchange: 1; ROBs; 3; Viaduct: 1 at km 602.2; Bypass: 6 of 36.50 km at Fagne-Dhule, Kusumbe, Ner, Shewali – Sakri, Chinchpada, Sarvad ; Major road junctions: 24; Service/ slip roads: 39.896 km ; Toll plazas: 2 at km 564.36 & km 620.56; Minor bridges : 90+9 on service roads; Minor road junctions: 80; Vehicular underpass: 13; Pedestrian/Cattle underpasses: 8; Culverts: 194; Truck laybys: 3; Rest Area: 2; Bus bays and shelters: 36; Re-constructions: 17.765 km at 6 locations; Metal Crash Barrier: 2*6.815 km.

3. Joint Secretary, DEA informed the PPPAC that the entire stretch from Amravati to Gujarat Maharashtra Border Section of NH-6 was earlier posed by MoRTH in the form of two projects i.e. Four-laning of Amravati to Jalgaon Section of NH-6 with TPC of Rs. 2537.81 crore, length of 275.225 km and Four laning of Jalgaon to Gujarat Maharashtra Border Section of NH-6 with TPC of Rs. 1968.37 crore, length of 208.844 km. The two proposals were cleared by the PPPAC at its 51st meeting held on March 09, 2012. The three proposals in Agenda Items I, II and III to be considered by the PPPAC at this meeting are a part of this earlier approved project stretch. MoRTH was requested to provide clarifications and reasons for termination of the earlier approved project and the present status of fulfilment of Conditions Precedent by the NHAI.

4. Member, NHAI stated that the projects were awarded on 31.03.2012 to M/s L&T Infrastructure with a premium of Rs. 131.04 crore and Rs. 145.08 crore respectively. The Concessionaire had fulfilled majority of its Conditions Precedents, but NHAI could procure only 80% of land after 380 days of signing of the Concession Agreement. Due to increase in cost, the Concessionaire expressed inability to continue and issued notice under section 37.2.1 of the Concession Agreement to NHAI. Accordingly, NHAI foreclosed the project on mutual consent with the approval of NHAI Board on 21.08.2014. Subsequently, it has been decided to implement the project by dividing the entire length into three packages i.e. (i) Amravati to Chikhli of 194 km with TPC of Rs. 2288.18 crore, (ii) Chikhli to Fagne of

150 km with TPC of Rs. 1852.50 crore and (iii) Fagne- Guj-Maharashtra Border of 140.794 km with TPC of Rs. 1885.74 crore.

5. Member, NHAI further stated that Environment clearance and Forest clearance (Stage-I) were obtained in April, 2013. GADs for RoB has been approved by Railways, about 94 percent land is already available and possession of 78% land obtained. Package I is expected to be viable with premium of Rs. 36.50 crore, Package II with VGF support of upto 1.55% of TPC and Package III with VGF support of upto 2.76% of TPC with 15% Return on Equity. He stated that even in the present circumstances where poor responses or very costly bids are being received on BOT (Toll) projects, the three Packages are expected to get reasonable bids on account of the high traffic plying on the stretch which is more than the traffic on projects where bids were received recently. The average traffic on the highway ranges from 20,000 PCUs to 27,000 PCUs for package I & III and from 25,000 PCUs to 32,000 PCUs for package II.

6. The Chair inquired on the response received by the NHAI for the projects recently approved by the PPPAC. Member, NHAI responded that NHAI has awarded projects of about 3060 km during 2014-15 which is more than double the length awarded in 2013-14 when only projects of 1435 km were awarded. During February and March, 2015, bidders have shown some interest in BOT (Toll) projects and the project from Shivpuri to Guna received bids on premium. The project from Hospet to Chitradurga received bids on premium though initial viability estimates had shown a requirement for marginal VGF. Another project, a stretch from Raipur to Bilaspur received bids with VGF requirement of 29% of TPC though a premium was expected as per NHAI's viability analysis and hence this project could not be awarded and the NHAI Board would be taking a decision on the project. As regards EPC projects, bids for Jabalpur- Kanti- Rewa Section of NH-7 were received about 22% lower than the estimate by NHAI.

7. Chair inquired on the reasons for the VGF bid for Raipur-Bilaspur section when NHAI expected a premium offer of Rs. 45 crore. Member, NHAI responded that presently there is heavy traffic on the stretch ranging from 20,000 PCUs to 32,000 PCUs and the traffic is mainly for transportation of coal, cement and steel. However, the Ministry of Railways has planned to augment the Railway line along this stretch which may reduce road traffic substantially. This may have caused the bidders to estimate lower revenues resulting in submission of VGF bids. The matter would be placed before the NHAI board for taking a decision for acceptance of the bids.



8. Joint Secretary, DoE sought clarification on why the Concession Periods were different when the three Packages to be bid out were on a continuous stretch and JS, DEA also asked why the stretches were being re-packaged in three stretches instead of the earlier two and whether the earlier model (two stretches) could result in premium in both instead of the current proposal of two VGF and one premium projections. CGM, NHAI responded that Concession Period is fixed based on the total traffic and breach capacity of the highway. The Concession Periods of Package I & II have been fixed at 19 years as the average traffic is around 25,000 PCUs for both projects and the Concession Period of Package III has been fixed at 15 years based on the average traffic of around 31,000 PCUs. Further, the reason for taking up the projects in three instead of two stretches is because the Project Costs are high (the escalated aggregate cost for all stretches is Rs 6026.42 crores as compared to Rs 4506 crores in 2012) and larger stretches are unlikely to receive bid interest or may entail very high VGF bids.

9. Joint Advisor, Niti Aayog stated that the condition of six laning in built- up areas has been deleted in the new manual of IRC:SP:84-2014. The projected traffic for the stretches do not justify six laning and the provision of six laning may be deleted especially where service roads have been provided. CGM, NHAI responded that six laning has been provided in grade separator flyovers, approach roads and VUP/LVUP/PUP in accordance with the new manual of IRC: SP:84-2014. Further, service roads have been proposed only in built- up areas considering safety of the inhabitants in built -up area based on specifications of the manual. It was also confirmed that all proposed bridges and structures are 4 laned.

10. Joint Secretary, DEA sought clarification on the increase in project cost from Rs. 9.32 crore per km, approved by the PPPAC in March, 2012 to Rs. 12.43 crore per km now proposed i.e an increase in the project cost by 34% were sought. Member, NHAI responded that the increase in project cost from Rs. Rs. 4506.18 crore (Rs. 9.32 crore per km) approved in March, 2012 to Rs. 6026.42 crore (Rs. 12.43 crore per km) is due to the implementation of the revised Manual of Standards & Specifications (IRC: SP: 84-2014) and updation of Schedule of Rates (SOR) from 2011-12 to 2013-14. The cost has then been further updated for 2015 by increasing 5% per year as per the NHAI policy, however the per km cost for the proposed project is lesser than the per km cost of Rs. 13.67 crore approved as per MoRTH's guidelines of 2014-15 and is reasonable.

11. Joint Secretary, DEA requested clarifications on the proposed Khamgaon bypass (SH-188B) along the Amravati- Chikhli Section where there is already an existing bypass. CGM, NHAI clarified that the Khamgaon bypass constructed by the state PWD is not used for the proposed project stretch as it is only two-laned and

very congested and the geometry of the existing bypass is badly aligned with about 19 bends. The new 4 lane bypass is proposed on the north side whereas existing bypass is on south side. Director DEA advised MoRTH/ NHAI to ensure that there would not be any legal hurdles when the new concession comes into effect as the existing bypass is on BOT (Toll) basis. CGM, NHAI agreed to do so.

(Action: MoRTH/ NHAI)

12. Director, DEA stated that similarly there are existing toll plazas at Fekri bypass (km 399.950), at Nasirabad bypass (km 418.500) in Package II and Dhulia bypass in Package III and these may also pose legal hurdles. CGM, NHAI responded that buyback negotiation of toll plaza at Fakri where Concession Period is due to end in October, 2022 is under consideration with MoRTH. The Concession Period of the toll plaza at Nashirabad is due to expire in November, 2017 i.e. before the COD of the proposed project; hence buyback may not be required. As regards, Dhulia bypass, Government of Maharashtra has recently stopped collection of toll on this toll plaza. Director, DEA advised that the date of handover of these stretches where tolls are currently being levied should be indicated in the DCA and Schedule 'R' to avoid legal complications. This was agreed to.

(Action: MoRTH/ NHAI)

13. Director, DEA indicated that total length chargeable for toll indicated in Schedule 'R' differs from the actual lengths in Package I & III, hence, Schedule 'R' may be reconciled and corrected. CGM, NHAI responded that Schedule 'R' has been corrected and modified. She further stated that MoRTH has not provided the calculations of Interest during Construction Period (IDC) which forms part of the TPC for the Chikli to Fagne section. CGM, NHAI responded that the calculation sheet is part of the financial analysis which has been submitted along with the proposal; however, detailed calculation sheet for IDC shall be given separately. This was agreed to.

(Action: MoRTH/ NHAI)

14. **The PPPAC recommended the following proposals for grant of final approval:**

- (i) **Four laning of Amravati to Chikhli Section of NH-6 from Km 166.000 to Km 360.000 in the state of Maharashtra under NHDP Phase IV on Design, Build, Finance, Operate, Transfer (DBFOT) Toll basis (Package-I), for TPC of Rs. 2288.18 crore**

- (ii) Four laning of Chikhli to Fagne Section of NH-6 from Km 360.000 to Km 510.000 in the state of Maharashtra under NHDP Phase IV on Design, Build, Finance, Operate, Transfer (DBFOT) Toll basis(Package-II), for TPC of Rs. 1852.50 crore.
- (iii) Four laning of Fagne- Guj-Maharashtra Border Section of NH-6 from Km 510.000 to Km 650.794 in the state of Maharashtra under NHDP Phase IV on Design, Build, Finance, Operate, Transfer (DBFOT) Toll basis(Package-III), for TPC of Rs. 1885.74 crore with VGF as per the Scheme Guidelines,

subject to fulfilment of the following conditions, for the above three projects:

MoRTH shall issue Request for Proposal (RFP) only after,

- 14.1. Completing the land acquisition as per the decision of PPPAC in its 56th meeting held on December 21, 2012 (at least 60% of the total land should be available or notification under Section 3(A) should have been issued for at least 90 percent of the land required and notification under Section 3(D) should have been issued for at least 60 percent of the land required for the project.)
- 14.2. Obtaining the environment and forest clearances (stage-I) for the project.
- 14.3. MoRTH shall revise Schedule 'R' to indicate correct tollable length and date of handover of the stretches where toll is currently being levied on existing BOT (toll) contract.
- 14.4. MoRTH shall incorporate the observations of NITI Aayog and DEA with respect to the project DCAs as agreed to by MoRTH in their responses.
- 14.5. MoRTH shall obtain prior approval of the PPPAC on any change in scope of work or project configuration as noted above.
- 14.6. MoRTH shall circulate the revised documents to the members of the PPPAC for record.

(Action: MoRTH/ NHAI)

15. Subsequent to the PPPAC meeting, MoEF has advised that no proposal has been received for any of the three packages for approval under the Forest (Conservation) Act, 1980. Hence, PPPAC may be informed, with reasons, if issue of any of the RfPs is delayed beyond four months from the PPPAC meeting.

(Action: MoRTH/ NHAI)



Agenda Item IV: Proposal from Ministry of Road Transport & Highways for grant of final approval: Four laning of Cuttack Angul Section of NH-42 from Km 0.000 to Km 112.000 in the state of Odisha under NHDP Phase IV on Design, Build, Finance, Operate, Transfer (DBFOT) Toll basis

Total length: 112 km; Total Project Cost: Rs. 1462.50 crore; Cost of pre-construction activities to be financed by NHAI: Rs. 112.88 crore; Concession Period: 23 years including 2.5 years of construction period.

Land status: Total land required: 688.34 ha; Land available: 191.37 ha (27.80%); land to be acquired- 466.97 (72.20%); Forest land – 21.20 ha, Govt. Land: 218.565 ha (31.75%); Notified under 3A: 100% ; Notified under 3D (including Govt land of 218.565 ha + private land of 228.440 ha + forest land of 26.97 ha): 473.98 ha (95.37%); Notified under 3G: 101.23 ha; land in possession: 191.37 ha (27.80 %); Compensation deposited – Rs. 58.415 crore, however, disbursement is in process.

Status of Clearances: Environment Clearance: obtained on 04.07.2013; Forest Clearances Stage-1: proposal submitted on 11.07.2013, approval yet to be received; GAD: approved by Railways on 12.06.2013; Wild life Clearance: Not required

Major development works/ structures: Major Bridge: 3 (new 4 lane -1 & 2 lane-2); Flyovers: 5; ROBs; 1; Bypass: 2 of 25.30 km at Indipur/Shmnai (3.7 km) & Angul (21.6 km); Service/ slip roads: 29 km ; Toll plazas: 2 at km 22.800 & km 85.200; Minor bridges : 23 (new 4 lane -8 & 2 lane-15); Vehicular / Pedestrian/Cattle underpasses: 7; Culverts: 213; Truck laybys: 1 at km 19.90 (both side); Bus bays and shelters: 74.

16. Member, NHAI Director, DEA informed the PPPAC that the PPPAC had earlier cleared the stretch in its 46th meeting held on September 14, 2011 with TPC of Rs. 1123.69 crore (Rs. 10.03 crore per km) and the project was awarded on 30.11.2011 to M/s Ashoka Buildcon Ltd with a premium of Rs. 61.09 crore. The Concession Agreement was signed on 14.03.2012; however, the concession was terminated by the NHAI in July 14, 2014. Joint Secretary, DEA requested for clarifications and reasons for termination of the earlier approved project and the present status of fulfilment of Conditions Precedent by the NHAI.

17. Member, NHAI stated that NHAI could not fulfil Conditions Precedent as per the provisions of the Concession Agreement i.e. procure 80% of land, Environment/ Forest Clearance, etc within 180 days of signing of the Concession Agreement and accordingly, NHAI had foreclosed the project on mutual consent after signing supplementary agreement on 14.07.2014.

18. Member, NHAI further stated that Environment clearance was obtained in July 04, 2013 and GADs for RoB has been approved from Railways on June 12, 2013, however, only 27.80 percent land is currently available and in possession. While the proposal for Forest clearance (Stage-I) have been submitted on July 11, 2013; clearance is yet to be obtained. The project is expected to be viable with VGF upto 16.75% of TPC to achieve 15% Return on Equity.

19. Director, DEA indicated that TPC for the project has been increased from Rs. 1123.69 crore (10.03 crore per km) approved by the PPPAC in September 14, 2011 to Rs. 1462.50 crore (13.06 crore per km) now proposed. Justifications for increase in project cost by 30% were sought. Member, NHAI responded that increase in project cost is due to the implementation of the revised Manual of Standard & Specifications (IRC:SP:84-2014) which constitutes about 6% of TPC and updation of Schedule of Rates (SOR) from 2011-12 to 2013-14 and further updated upto 2015 by increasing 5% per year as per the NHAI policy. Further, per km cost for the proposed project is less than the per km cost of Rs. 13.67 crore indicated in MoRTH circular dated 07.01.2015 for 2014-15. Hence, proposed cost is reasonable.

20. Joint Advisor, Niti Aayog stated that the Feasibility Report of the project states that around 55% of the project road falls under forest area and in the forest area a few elephant corridors across NH-42 have been displayed. He expressed concern as a substantial portion (over 50%) of the total land involved for the project would require forest clearance and suggested exploring the possibility of realignment of project carriageway so as to avoid elephant corridors and reduce usage of forest areas.

21. Additional Secretary, DEA sought clarification as to why MoRTH/NHAI has posed the project before the PPPAC when the Conditions Precedent with respect to land acquisition and forest clearances has not been met. The project was earlier fore closed due to non-fulfilment of Conditions Precedent by NHAI. Member, NHAI responded that proposal has been submitted as the project fulfilled the conditions set by the PPPAC in its 56th meeting held on December 21, 2012 that "atleast 60% of the total land should be available or notification under Section 3(A) should have been issued for at least 90 percent of the land required and notification under Section 3(D) should have been issued for atleast 60 percent of the land required for the project". In the proposed project, notification under sections 3A and 3D have been completed for 100% and 95% of the land to be acquired as against 90% and 60% prescribed by the PPPAC, however compensation could not be distributed as land owners demanded revised compensation as per the new land acquisition policy. NHAI has already deposited Rs. 58 crore for disbursement to land owners. The matter has been discussed with the Competent Authority for Land Acquisition (CALA) who has assured to resolve the matter on priority basis and modify the compensation amount

73

as per rules. Further, forest clearance is also required as project stretch includes about 27 ha land in the forest area. The proposal has been submitted on July 11, 2013 and compliance of observations have been submitted to DFO for Stage-I clearance. PPPAC has to take a call regarding approval of the project now or wait until all clearances are obtained by NHAI as it is almost certain that the compensation packages will have to be reworked.

22. Joint Secretary, DEA stated that PPPAC has the option to either defer the project till completion of the Conditions Precedent by NHAI or may grant conditional approval stating that the RfP may be issued only after completing the land acquisition and forest clearances as per the provisions of the DCA. However, if the compensation has to be reviewed, it is unlikely that the acquisition will be finalised in a short period of time. The effect of further inordinate delays on TPC may need to be considered.

23. The Chair indicated that once the proposal is placed before the PPPAC, MoRTH/ NHAI should take the responsibility for completing the clearances in time. Accordingly the PPPAC may consider clearing the proposal subject to the condition that the RfP is issued only after at least 60% of the total land required is in possession and notification under Section 3(G) should have been issued for at least 90 percent of the land required. Further, in case the RFP is not issued in four months from the PPPAC clearance, the PPPAC may be informed indicating reasons for delay. This was agreed to.

(Action: MoRTH/ NHAI)

24. **The PPPAC recommended the proposal for grant of final approval: Four laning of Cuttack Angul Section of NH-42 from Km 0.000 to Km 112.000 in the state of Odisha under under NHDP Phase IV on Design, Build, Finance, Operate, Transfer (DBFOT) basis, for TPC of Rs. 1462.50 crore with VGF as per the Scheme Guidelines, subject to fulfilment of the following conditions:**

MoRTH shall issue Request for Proposal (RFP) only after;

- 24.1. Completing the land acquisition such that at least 60% of the total land should be in possession and notification under Section 3(G) should have been issued for at least 90 percent of the land required.
- 24.2. Obtaining the environment and forest clearances (stage-I) for the project.
- 24.3. MoRTH shall incorporate the observations of NITI Aayog and DEA with respect to the project DCAs as agreed to by MoRTH in their responses.



- 24.4. MoRTH shall obtain prior approval of the PPPAC on any change in scope of work or project configuration as noted above.
- 24.5. In case of delay of more than four months in issue of RfP from the date of the PPPAC meeting , PPPAC may be informed indicating reasons for delay.
- 24.6. MoRTH shall circulate the revised documents to the members of the PPPAC for record.

(Action: MoRTH/ NHAI)

25. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.



Ministry of Finance
Department of Economic Affairs

Public Private Partnership Appraisal Committee

72nd Meeting on April 10, 2015

List of Participants

I. Department of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance

- i. Shri Rajiv Mehrishi, Secretary, Economic Affairs & Finance Secretary
(In Chair)
- ii. Shri Ajay Tyagi, Additional Secretary
- iii. Ms. Sharmila Chavaly, Joint Secretary
- iv. Ms. Abhilasha Mahapatra, Director (PPP)
- v. Shri V. Srikanth, Deputy Director (PPP)

II. Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance

- vi. Dr. Arunish Chawla, Joint Secretary (PF-II)

III. NITI AAYOG

- vii. Shri Amitabha Ray, Joint Adviser
- viii. Dr. Tanu Kathuria, E.O
- ix. Shri. Renbi Jamir, R.O

IV. Ministry of Road Transport & Highways (MoRTH)

- i. Shri Rohit K. Singh, Joint Secretary (H)
- ii. Shri Pawan Kumar, SE (PPP)
- iii. Shri Akhtarul Hanif, DS & DFA

V. National Highway Authority of India

- iv. Shri Sudhir Kumar, Member (PPP)
- v. Shri A.K. Singh, CGM
- vi. Shri A.K. Mishra, CGM
- vii. Shri Ashish Asati, GM (T)
- viii. Shri Sanjay Saxena, GM (Tech.)
- ix. Shri Mudit Garg

